

CONFIDENTIAL PTQ5928

PAGE 01 STATE 217466 010104Z  
ORIGIN SA-00

INFO	LOG-00	NP-00	ACQ-00	CIAE-00	INL-00	DODE-00	NOTE-00
	DS-00	EB-00	ED-01	FAAE-00	FBIE-00	VC-00	TEDE-00
	INR-00	L-00	VCE-00	AC-01	NEA-00	DCP-01	NSAE-00
	PM-00	ACE-00	PMB-00	DSCC-00	PRM-00	DRL-02	NFAT-00
	SAS-00	/005R					

217466  
 SOURCE: KODAKD.001017  
 DRAFTED BY: SA/PAB:JOANNE WAGNER:JTW -- 10/31/02 7-6710 CBL CBRBHUTTO1  
 APPROVED BY: SA:CROCCA  
 SA/PAB:GFEIERSTEIN

-----01C806 010106Z /38

P 010104Z NOV 02  
 FM SECSTATE WASHDC  
 TO AMEMBASSY ISLAMABAD PRIORITY  
 INFO AMCONSUL PESHAWAR PRIORITY  
 AMEMBASSY NEW DELHI PRIORITY

RELEASED IN FULL

C O N F I D E N T I A L STATE 217466

E.O. 12958: DECL: 10/28/2012  
 TAGS: PREL, PGOV, MARR, PK, IN, XD  
 SUBJECT: A/S ROCCA MEETS BENAZIR BHUTTO: PPP WON'T JOIN  
 AN MMA CABINET... BUT IT'S TEMPTING

CLASSIFIED BY A/S CHRISTINA ROCCA FOR REASONS 1.5 B/D.

1. (C) SUMMARY. DURING AN OCTOBER 28 MEETING WITH A/S  
 CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 STATE 217466 010104Z  
 ROCCA, FORMER PAKISTANI PRIME MINISTER AND CURRENT HEAD OF  
 THE PAKISTAN PEOPLE'S PARTY (PPP) BENIZIR BHUTTO:

-- REPORTED THAT PAKISTANI PRESIDENT MUSHARRAF HAD OFFERED  
 THE PREMIERSHIP TO PPP DEPUTY MUKHDOOM AMIN FAHIM IF THE  
 PPP JOINS IN GOVERNMENT, WHILE MAKING THE SAME OFFER AT  
 LEAST TO MMA (RELIGIOUS PARTY COALITION) CANDIDATE AND  
 ISLAMIC EXTREMIST FAZL UR-REHMAN AND PML-Q STALWART MIR  
 ZAFARULLAH KHAN JAMALI;

-- DESCRIBED HER "NIGHTMARE SCENARIO" IN WHICH THE MMA  
 GAINS CONTROL OF THE PRESIDENCY AND THE MILITARY;

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF STATE  
 REVIEW AUTHORITY: ARCHIE M BOLSTER  
 DATE/CASE ID: 13 APR 2011 200800198

**UNCLASSIFIED**

UNCLASSIFIED U.S. Department of State Case No. F-2008-00198 Doc No. C17567150 Date: 09/22/2012  
-- CLAIMED THAT THE PPP WOULD NOT ENTER INTO AN MMA CABINET DESPITE AN ALLEGED OFFER BY THE MMA TO GRANT AMNESTY TO JAILED/EXILED PPP LEADERS, INCLUDING HERSELF AND HER HUSBAND, IN EXCHANGE FOR PPP SUPPORT;

-- STRESSED THAT THE PML-Q NEEDED NEITHER THE PPP NOR THE MMA TO FORM A GOVERNMENT, AND SPECULATED THAT THE PPP WOULD SIT IN OPPOSITION; AND

-- PRESSED A/S ROCCA TO CONVEY U.S. SUPPORT FOR A PPP PRIME MINISTER TO MUSHARRAF.

2. (C) A/S ROCCA STRESSED THAT THE U.S. WOULD NOT MEDDLE IN PAKISTAN'S INTERNAL AFFAIRS, AND URGED BHUTTO, DESPITE THEIR HISTORY, TO CONSIDER THE VISION THE PPP AND MUSHARRAF SHARE FOR A DEMOCRATIC PAKISTAN WHEN MAKING COALITION DECISIONS. END SUMMARY

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 STATE 217466 010104Z  
"ELECTIONS WERE RIGGED"

3. (C) AFTER INFORMING A/S ROCCA THAT SHE HAS ASKED THE ELECTION COMMITTEE FOR INDIVIDUAL POLLING STATION RESULTS IN ORDER TO COMPLETE A SEAT-BY-SEAT ANALYSIS OF WHAT THE PPP BELIEVES WAS A RIGGED AND STOLEN ELECTION, BHUTTO ASKED FOR U.S. SUPPORT OF THIS REQUEST. (NONE WAS OFFERED.) SHE HAS ALSO ASKED FOR EU SUPPORT.

MUSHARRAF OFFERS PREMIERSHIP TO THE PPP - AND THE MMA, PML-Q

4. (C) ALTHOUGH -- CONTRARY TO RUMORS -- THERE HAD BEEN NO JOINT MUSHARRAF-FAHIM CALL TO BHUTTO, BHUTTO'S DEPUTY, AMIN FAHIM, HAS HAD SEVERAL CONVERSATIONS WITH THE PAKISTANI PRESIDENT. BHUTTO SAID MUSHARRAF OFFERED FAHIM THE PREMIERSHIP, SAID HE WANTED TO KEEP ZUBEDA JALAL AT THE EDUCATION MINISTRY, AND PROMISED THAT AS PRIME MINISTER, FAHIM COULD DECLARE AN AMNESTY FOR JAILED/EXILED PPP LEADERS - INCLUDING BHUTTO -- IF THE PPP WOULD JOIN THE PML-Q IN GOVERNMENT. BHUTTO SAID SHE IS WARY OF MUSHARRAF; HE OFFERED THE FAHIM DEAL ON OCTOBER 10, BUT HAS SINCE REPORTEDLY MADE THE SAME OFFER TO MMA HARD-LINER REHMAN AND PML-Q STALWART JAMALI. IS HE INSINCERE, SHE ASKED, OR SIMPLY INEFFICIENT? FOR THE FIRST OF MANY TIMES, BHUTTO ASKED WHETHER THE U.S. BELIEVES MUSHARRAF

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 04 STATE 217466 010104Z  
NIGHTMARE SCENARIO - MMA CONTROLS PRESIDENCY AND MILITARY  
-----

5. (C) BHUTTO CHARGED THAT MUSHARRAF IS SURROUNDED BY ADVISORS WITH TALIBAN AND EVEN AL-QAEDA CONNECTIONS. FOR EXAMPLE, PRINCIPAL SECRETARY TARIQ AZIZ'S BROTHER-IN-LAW, SHE CLAIMED, IS INVOLVED WITH TERRORIST GROUP LASHKAR-I-JHANGVI. THE SON OF THE PUNJAB DEPUTY SECRETARY GENERAL DIED FIGHTING FOR THE TALIBAN IN AFGHANISTAN; BHUTTO HAS NO CONFIDENCE HE WILL PROSECUTE TERRORISTS. BHUTTO ALSO VOICED HER DISTRUST OF THE MILITARY AND THE ISI, CLAIMING THAT 300 EX-ISI WHO "FOUGHT IN THE JIHAD" HAVE BEEN REHIRED. THERE IS, SHE SAID, A CELL IN ISI WHICH VETS EVERY CIVILIAN GOVERNMENTAL APPOINTMENT, AND EVERY LOCAL NAZIM HAS AN ISI COLONEL WHO MUST APPROVE ALL HIRING DECISIONS. SHE IS AFRAID THAT MILITARY POWERS BEHIND THE ISI, WHO ONCE USED THAT BODY TO CONTROL THE COUNTRY, ARE NOW TRYING TO USE THE RELIGIOUS PARTIES AS SURROGATES -- A DANGEROUS MOVE.

6. (C) BHUTTO DESCRIBED HER "NIGHTMARE SCENARIO" - ADMITTEDLY FAR-FETCHED -- IN WHICH THE RELIGIOUS PARTIES CONTROL BOTH THE PRESIDENCY AND THE MILITARY. IF THE MMA CAPTURES THE SENATE CHAIRMAN POSITION, AND MUSHARRAF (EITHER VOLUNTARILY OR INVOLUNTARILY) LEAVES OFFICE, THE SENATE CHAIR WOULD THEN BECOME PRESIDENT - WITH THE POWER TO APPOINT THE CHIEF OF THE ARMY. THE MMA PRESIDENT COULD THEN ADOPT AN ISLAMIC AGENDA BACKED BY NUCLEAR POWER AND DESTABILIZE THE ENTIRE REGION. (NOTE: THIS OVERLOOKS THAT THERE WILL ALSO BE A PRIME MINISTER RUNNING THE GOVERNMENT.) BHUTTO CALLED FOR SIGNIFICANT MILITARY

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 05 STATE 217466 010104Z  
REFORM, INCLUDING COMPLETE CIVILIAN CONTROL OF THE MILITARY, DEVELOPMENT OF THE COMMAND AND CONTROL NECESSARY TO ASSURE THE SAFETY OF PAKISTAN'S NUCLEAR ARSENAL, AND A CHANGE IN THE MILITARY MINDSET OPPOSING NORMALIZATION OF RELATIONS WITH INDIA.

PPP WILL NOT SIT IN AN MMA CABINET - BUT IT IS TEMPTING  
-----

7. (C) RESPONDING TO A/S ROCCA, BHUTTO EMPHASIZED THAT THE PPP "WILL NOT SIT IN AN MMA CABINET" AS THEIR

UNCLASSIFIED

STANDS FOR RIGHTS FOR WOMEN, EDUCATION AND FOREIGN INVESTMENT, GOALS TOO DIFFERENT FROM THOSE OF THE MMA FOR A COALITION TO BE WORKABLE; SHE WOULD PREFER A GOVERNMENT OF NATIONAL CONSENSUS WITH THE BACKING OF THE MILITARY. BHUTTO ADMITTED, HOWEVER, THAT THE PROSPECT OF RETURNING TO AND WORKING FOR CHANGE IN HER COUNTRY -- AS WELL AS SEEING HER HUSBAND RELEASED AFTER SIX YEARS IN JAIL -- IS

TEMPTING. SHE QUESTIONED, HOWEVER, HOW MUCH INFLUENCE THE PPP WILL HAVE IN THE 320-SEAT NATIONAL ASSEMBLY WITH ONLY 63 SEATS. WHEN PRESSED AS TO WHETHER SHE COULD SUPPORT MMA CANDIDATE REHMAN AS PM, HOWEVER, BHUTTO ANSWERED ONLY THAT SHE WANTS TO KEEP THE ARD (THE LOOSE COALITION OF MORE MINOR PARTIES TO WHICH THE LARGER PPP IS A PART) INTACT. FOR NOW, BHUTTO CONTINUED, THE PPP MUST KEEP ITS OPTIONS OPEN IN ORDER TO END UP WITH SOME SIGNIFICANT POSITIONS IN THE NEW GOVERNMENT. SHE REPEATED, HOWEVER, THAT THE PPP WILL NOT SIT IN AN MMA CABINET.

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 06 STATE 217466 010104Z

8. (C) AGAIN RESPONDING TO ROCCA, BHUTTO PREDICTED THAT MUSHARRAF CAN COBBLE TOGETHER A MINORITY GOVERNMENT WITHOUT EITHER THE MMA OR THE PPP. SHE SPECULATED THAT IF THE PPP DOES NOT ENTER THE COALITION, THE PML-Q, ALONG WITH THE INDEPENDENTS AND OTHER MINOR PLAYERS, E.G., THE MQM, WOULD FORM A GOVERNMENT. THE MMA MAY ALSO BE INVITED TO JOIN, BUT BHUTTO INSISTED THAT THE RELIGIOUS COALITION PARTY IS NOT ACTUALLY NEEDED. IF INVITED TO JOIN THE GOVERNMENT, HOWEVER, THE MMA WOULD LIKELY GET PROVINCIAL CONTROL OF THE NWFP AND PERHAPS OF BALUCHISTAN, AND THE PPP WOULD THEN SIT IN OPPOSITION. A/S ROCCA ASKED BHUTTO WHETHER SHE BELIEVED THE PPP COULD WIN ACCEPTANCE OF ITS BASIC POLITICAL AND SOCIAL OBJECTIVES AS PART OF A COALITION WITH THE RELIGIOUS PARTIES AND COULD THE PPP COULD EFFECT CHANGE MORE EFFICIENTLY FROM WITHIN THAT GOVERNMENT. BHUTTO REPLIED THAT THAT WAS THE RUB. SHE ALSO SAID THAT WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF A "TRANSITION GOVERNMENT," WITH WASHINGTON BACKING AND THE SUPPORT OF THE PAKISTANI MILITARY, A PPP ALLIANCE WITH THE GOVERNMENT COULD BECOME A POLITICAL REALITY. THE PPP, HOWEVER, WOULD NEED GUARANTEED INDEMNITY FOR ITS JAILED/EXILED LEADERS, AND PASSAGE OF A FAIR ELECTIONS BILL.

A/S ROCCA: CONSIDER YOUR VISION FOR PAKISTAN  
-----

9. (C) A/S ROCCA AGREED THAT THE U.S. VIEWS THE NEXT

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED U.S. Department of State Case No. F-2008-00198 Doc No. C17567150 Date: 09/22/2012  
PAKISTAN GOVERNMENT AS A TRANSITION GOVERNMENT, WORKING TO MOVE PAKISTAN FURTHER TOWARDS A DEMOCRATIC SYSTEM. UNCLASSIFIED  
HOWEVER, ANY U.S. ADVICE TO PRESIDENT MUSHARRAF AS TO WHO THE NEXT PRIME MINISTER SHOULD BE WOULD BE ILL-ADVISED AND  
CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 07 STATE 217466 010104Z  
ILL-RECEIVED; THE U.S. WILL NOT MEDDLE IN PAKISTAN'S INTERNAL AFFAIRS. BHUTTO AGREED THAT IT WOULD BE POOR OPTICS, BUT REEMPHASIZED HER DESIRE TO KNOW WHETHER MUSHARRAF WAS SENDING THE SAME MESSAGE TO THE U.S. AS TO THE PPP. A/S ROCCA AGAIN CONFIRMED THE U.S. VISION OF A

MODERATE PAKISTAN ROOTED IN DEMOCRACY, WITH A CONTINUING COMMITMENT TO THE WAR AGAINST TERRORISM, ECONOMIC REFORM, AND RESPECT FOR HUMAN RIGHTS.

10. (C) AS THE GROUP WAS LEAVING, PPP ADVISOR DEAN REED ASKED WHAT THE U.S. REACTION WOULD BE IF BHUTTO TOOK ADVANTAGE OF AN MMA OFFER TO RETURN SAFELY TO PAKISTAN IN RETURN FOR PPP SUPPORT FOR AN MMA PRIME MINISTER. A/S ROCCA STRESSED THAT THE IMPORTANT QUESTION IS HOW THE PAKISTANI PEOPLE WOULD RESPOND. THE PPP SHOULD CONSIDER WHETHER SUCH A DEAL IS CONSONANT WITH THEIR VISION FOR PAKISTAN WHEN MAKING A COALITION DECISION.

COMMENT  
-----

11. (C) THE CLEAR MESSAGE FROM THE MEETING IS THAT THE PPP DOES NOT YET HAVE ITS POST-ELECTION DANCE CARD FILLED - AND IN FACT IS NOT SURE WHO TO DANCE WITH. ALTHOUGH BHUTTO REPEATEDLY STRESSED THAT THE PPP WOULD NOT ENTER AN MMA CABINET, SHE ALSO ADMITTED THAT IT WOULD BE TEMPTING TO HAVE ALL CHARGES AGAINST HER AND THE PPP LEADERSHIP DROPPED AND HER HUSBAND RELEASED FROM JAIL - WHICH SHE MAY BE ABLE TO ACCOMPLISH BY AGREEING TO AN MMA PRIME MINISTER. ON THE OTHER HAND, THE VISION OF AN MMA-PPP  
CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 08 STATE 217466 010104Z  
COALITION TAKING POWER IN ISLAMABAD MAY WELL BE MUSHARRAF'S "NIGHTMARE SCENARIO."  
POWELL

CONFIDENTIAL

<< END OF DOCUMENT >>

UNCLASSIFIED